

Marquette University
Department of Political Science

POSC 204
Fall 2006
Thursdays, 4-6
Wehr Physics 418

Prof. M. Fleet
Wehr Physics 446
Of. Hrs. - T-Th, 9:30-11:00
W, 2:00-5:00

Core Seminar in Comparative Politics

This seminar surveys the field of comparative politics. Drawing from political theory and modern sociology, comparative politics studies political phenomena in multiple settings in an effort to identify and more fully understand the interplay of the factors and forces involved. Its literature has grown to enormous proportions in the last fifty years. To minimize superficial treatment of that literature, we will not attempt to “cover” all of it, but will address in some depth the following: a) the nature and limitations of social science generally; b) the strengths and weaknesses of leading theoretical approaches in comparative politics; and c) related conceptual and methodological issues. Reading materials include both classic works, and articles and surveys of the field by contemporary scholars.

The seminar will require the active participation of all. This means doing the assigned reading and coming to seminar sessions prepared to discuss it critically with others. It also means presenting **four** review papers of between 1,000 and 1,250 words each, in which (one or more) of the recommended readings for a particular week are briefly summarized and then assessed in terms of its (their) strengths, weaknesses, and problematic aspects. Each of these papers will count for **10%** of the semester grade, and is to be submitted in advance of the seminar session to which it corresponds. In addition, students will prepare and submit a more substantial seminar essay of between 4,000 and 5,000 words, in which two or more theoretical approaches (e.g., marxism, structuralism, weberian analysis, political culture, rational choice, the new institutionalism, etc.) are compared, contrasted, evaluated in relation to specific political phenomena. These essays will count for **40%** of the semester grade, and are due on December 14th. The remaining **20%** of the grade will be based on the student's participation in the seminar both in leading discussions and in responding constructively to others.

Papers containing arguments or other material taken from sources that are not properly identified and attributed (i.e., plagiarism) will be treated harshly.

The following books should be purchased:

B. Guy Peters, **Comparative Politics: Theory and Methods** (paper);
Mark Irving Lichbach and Alan Zuckerman, **Comparative Politics, Rationality, Culture, and Structure** (paper);
Alfred Stepan, **Arguing Comparative Politics** (paper);
Guillermo O'Donnell, Jorge Vargas Cullel, and Osvaldo M. Iazzetta, **The Quality**

of Democracy, Theories and Applications (paper);
Ellen Meiksins Wood, **Democracy against Capitalism** (paper);
Kristin Renwick Monroe (ed.), **Perestroika!, The Raucous Rebellion in
Political Science** (paper)

Additional readings, both required and recommended, have been placed on electronic reserve, and are indicated in the following outline.

Seminar Outline and Readings

1. August 31st - Introduction

Discussion Topic: "Political Science, Comparative Politics, and the Quality of Democracy" - using materials to be distributed at the seminar;

2. September 7th - Research Design, Case Studies, and Methods of Analysis

Required Readings: Peters, Comparative Politics: Theory and Methods, 1998, Chapters 1-4 (on comparison, case loads, and measurement and bias), pp. 1-108;

Recommended Readings: Collier, "The Comparative Method," in Finifter (ed.), Political Science: The State of the Discipline II, 1993, pp. 105-119; Laitin, "Comparative Politics: The State of the Subdiscipline," APSA paper, 2000; Peter Hall, "Letter from the President, Beyond the Comparative Method," APSA-CP Newsletter, Vol. 15, Issue 2, Summer 2004, pp. 1-4; Symposium: The Proliferation of Comparative Survey Research," APSA-CP Newsletter, Vol. 15, Issue 2, Summer 2004, pp. 5-25;

3. September 14th - Theories, Conclusions, and Problems

Required Readings: Peters, Comparative Politics: Theory and Methods, 1998, Chapters 5-10 (on theory, single-case studies, events data, statistical analysis, and the future of comparative politics), pp. 109-226;

Recommended Readings: Kohli et alia, "The Role of Theory in Comparative Politics," World Politics, 48, pp. 1-49; "Symposium: The Confluence of International Relations and Comparative Politics: Professional Dilemmas," APSA-CP Newsletter, Vol. 16, Issue 1, Winter 2005, pp. 7-25; and "Symposium: Should Everyone Do Fieldwork?," APSA-CP Newsletter, Vol. 16, Issue 2 (Summer 2005), pp. 8-18.

4. September 21st - Is a Science of Politics Possible?

Required Readings: Sodaro "Critical Thinking about Politics," in Sodaro, Comparative Politics: a Global Introduction, Ch. 3, pp. 51-73; Weber, "Objectivity

in Social Science and Social Policy, in Weber, The Methodology of the Social Sciences, 1949; pp. 47-112; Charles Taylor, "Interpretation and the Sciences of Man," in Taylor, Philosophy and the Human Sciences, Philosophical Papers, Vol. 2, Chapter One, pp. 15-57; Taylor, "Neutrality in Political Science" in Taylor, Philosophy and the Human Sciences, Philosophical Papers 2, Chapter Two, pp. 58-90; Van Evera, "Introduction," and "Hypotheses, Laws, and Theories: a User's Guide," in Van Evera, Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science, 1997, pp. 1-48;

Recommended Readings: Winch, The Idea of a Social Science and its Relationship to Philosophy, 1958; Bernard Crick, In Defence of Politics, 1962; David Runciman, "How Many Jelly Beans," in London Review of Books, Vol. 26, no. 5 (Aug. 15, 2004); Alisdair MacIntyre, "Is a Science of Comparative Politics Possible?," in MacIntyre, Against the Self Image of the Age: Essay on Ideology and Philosophy, 1971, pp. 260-279; and Ronald Chilcote, "Politics and the Science of Politics in Comparative Inquiry," and "Ideology and Issues of Comparative Politics," in Chilcote, Theories of Comparative Politics, 1994, Ch. 2, pp. 21-54 and pp 55-75;

5. September 28th - Marxism

Required Readings: Karl Marx, "The Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Napoleon," in McClellan (ed.), Karl Marx, Selected Writings, pp. 329-354; Marx, "The Grundrisse," in McClellan (ed.), Karl Marx, Selected Writings, pp. 375-422; and Meiksins Wood, Democracy against Capitalism, Introduction, Ch. 1, and Chs. 7-9, pp. 1-48 and 204-293;

Recommended Readings: Meiksins Wood, Democracy Against Capitalism (the rest); Nicos Mouzelis, "Political Transitions in Greece and Argentina: Towards a Reorientation of Marxist Political Theory," Comparative Political Studies, Vol. 21 (4), 1989, pp. 443-466; Marx, "The Communist Manifesto," "Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts," "The German Ideology," "Capital," Vol. 1, and "The Civil War in France," all in McLellan (ed.) Karl Marx, Selected Writings, pp. 245-272, 83-121, 175-208, 452-525, and 584-603; Theda Skocpol, "Explaining Social Revolutions: Alternatives to Existing Theories" in Skocpol, States and Social Revolution, 1979, pp. 3-43; and Albert O. Hirschman, The Passions and the Interests: Political Arguments for Capitalism Before its Triumph.

6. October 5th - Weber's sociology

Required Readings: Max Weber, "Basic Sociological Terms," and "The Types of Legitimate Domination," in Weber, Economy and Society, 1968, Vol. I, pp. 3-62 and 212-254; Weber, "Religious Ethics and the World: Economics," "Religious Ethics and the World: Politics," and "The Great Religions and the World," in Weber, Economy and Society, Vol. 2, pp. 576-589, 590-601, and 611-634;

Weber, "Politics as a Vocation," in Gerth and Mills (eds.), From Max Weber, 1971, pp. 77-128; and Jose Casanova, "Legitimacy and the Sociology of Modernization," in Vidich and Glassman (eds.), Conflict and Control, Challenge to Legitimacy of Modern Governments, pp.219-252;

Recommended Readings: Weber, The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism (Kahlberg, ed.), 2001, pp. 3-125; A. Giddens, "Introduction," "Politics and Sociology in the Thought of Max Weber," and "Max Weber and the Development of Capitalism," in Giddens, Politics, Sociology and Social Theory: Encounters with Classical and Contemporary Social Thought, 1995, pp. 1-4, 15-56, and 57-77;

7. October 12th - Political Culture

Required Readings: Harrison, "Why Culture Matters?," in Harrison and Huntington (eds.), Culture Matters, How Values Shape Human Progress, 2000; Almond, "The Study of Political Culture," in A Discipline Divided: Schools and Sects in Political Science, 1990, pp. 138-156; Inglehart, "The Renaissance of Political Culture," APSR, Vol. 82 (4), 1988, pp. 1203-30; Jackman and Miller, "The Poverty of Political Culture," in AJPS, Vol 40 (3), 1996, pp. 697-716; Wilson, "The Many Voices of Political Culture, Assessing Different Approaches," World Politics, 52 (2), 2000, pp. 246-273;

Recommended Readings: Geertz, "Thick Description: Towards an Interpretive Theory of Culture," in Geertz, The Interpretation of Culture, pp. 3-30; Samuel Huntington, "The Clash of Civilizations?," in Foreign Affairs, vol. 72, no. 3 (Summer 1993), pp. 23-49; Laitin, "Religion, Political Culture, and the Weberian Tradition," World Politics, 30 (4), 1978, pp. 563-592; and Robert Putnam, Making Democracy Work, 1993;

8. October 19th - Rational Choice

Required Readings: Downs, An Economic Theory of Democracy, 1957, p. 3-50; Geddes, "A Game-Theoretical Model of Reform in Latin American Democracies," APSR, Vol. 85 (2), 1991, pp. 371-392; Friedman, Ch. 1, "Economic Approaches to Politics," in "Symposium on Pathologies of Rational Choice Theory" Critical Review, Vol. 9, nos. 1 and 2, pp. 1-24; Robert Bates, "Letter from the President: Area Studies and the Discipline," APSA-CP Newsletter, 1996, pp. 1-2; Green and Shapiro, Ch. One, "Rationality in Politics and Economics," Ch. Two, "The Nature of Rational Choice Theory," and Ch. Three, "Methodological Pathologies," in Green and Shapiro, Pathologies of Rational Choice Theory, 1994, pp. 1-46; Johnson, "Preconception vs. Observation, or the contributions of rational choice theory and area studies to contemporary Political Science," PS, 1997, pp. 1-7;

Recommended Readings: Jean-Laurent Rosenthal, "The Political Economy of Absolutism," in Bates et alia, Analytic Narratives, 1988, pp. 64-107; Margaret Levi,

"Conscription: the Price of Citizenship," in Bates et alia, Analytic Narratives, 1988, pp. 109-146; Mancur Olson, "Dictatorship, Democracy and Development," APSR, Vol. 87 (3), pp. 567-576; Munck, "Game Theory and Comparative Politics: New Perspectives and Old Concerns," World Politics, 53 (Jan. 2001), pp. 173-204; various authors, "Symposium on Pathologies of Rational Choice Theory," in Critical Review, Vol. 9, no. 1 and 2, pp. 25-235; Greene and Shapiro, "Pathologies Revisited: Reflections on our Critics," Critical Review, Vol. 9, nos. 1 and 2, pp. 235-275; Mahoney, "Rational Choice Theory and the Comparative Method: an Emerging Synthesis?," Studies in Comparative International Development, Summer 2000, pp. 83-94; Johnson and Kleehn, "A Disaster in the Making: Rational Choice and Asian Studies," The National Interest, 36, Summer 1994, pp. 14-22;

9. **October 26th** - Neo-Institutionalism

Required Readings: Thelen, "Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics," Annual Review of Political Science, 1999 (2), pp. 369-404; March and Olsen, "The New Institutionalism: Organizational Factors in Political Life," American Political Science Review, Vol. 78 (3), 1984, pp. 734-749; Hall and Taylor, "Political Science and the Three New Institutionalisms," Political Studies, XLIV, 1996, pp. 936-957; Hay and Wincott, "Structure, Agency and Historical Institutionalism," Political Studies, XLVI, 1998, pp. 951-957;

Recommended Readings: Nordlinger, On the Autonomy of the Democratic State, 1981; North, Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance, 1990; Migdal, Strong Societies and Weak States: State-Society Relations and State Capabilities in the Third World, 1988; Migdal, Kohli, and Shue (eds.), State Power and Social Forces: Domination and Transformation in the Third World, 1994; March and Olsen, Rediscovering Institutions: The Organizational Basis of Politics, 1989;

10. **November 2nd** - Rationality, Culture, and Structure (1)

Required Readings: Lichbach and Zuckerman, Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure, 1997, Part I (Ch.1), Part II (Chs. 2, 3 and 4), and Part III (Ch. 5 and 6);

Recommended Readings: recommendations for weeks 7 and 8 on rational choice and culture; O'Donnell, Part IV, Chapters 7-11, in O'Donnell, Counterpoints, pp. 133-215; and Arturo Escobar, Encountering Development, the Making and Unmaking of the Third World, Chapters 1-4, pp. 3-153;

11. **November 9th** - Rationality, Culture, and Structure (2)

Required Readings: Lichbach and Zuckerman, Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure, 1997, Part III (Chs. 7 and 8), and Part IV (Chs. 9 and 10);

Recommended Readings: Przeworski, "A Flawed Blueprint," Harvard International Review, Spring 2003; in addition, see recommendations for week 9 and both Marxist and non-Marxist (e.g., neo-institutionalist) literature on the state;

12. **November 16th** - The Quality of Democracy

Required Readings: Guillermo O'Donnell, "Human Development, Human Rights, and Democracy," in O'Donnell, Vargas Cullell, and Iazzetta (eds.), The Quality of Democracy, Theory and Applications, pp. 9-92; and Jorge Vargas Cullell, "Democracy and the Quality of Democracy," in O'Donnell, Vargas Cullell, and Iazzetta (eds.), The Quality of Democracy, Theory and Applications, pp. 93-162;

Recommended Readings: "Part II: Comments by Workshop Participants, in O'Donnell, Vargas Cullell, and Iazzetta (eds.), The Quality of Democracy, Theory and Applications, pp. 165-264; and Peter Smith, Ch. 1, "Dimensions of Democracy," and Chs. 8-11, in Democracy in Latin America;

13. **November 30rd (Tuesday)** - Latin America in Comparative Perspective

Required Readings: Alfred E. Stepan, Chs. 3, 5, 8, 9, 11, 13 and 14, pp. 73-99, 167-199, 213-253, and 276-314;

Recommended Readings: Stepan, Arguing Comparative Politics (all remaining articles (Chapters 1, 2, 4, 6, 7, 10, 12, and 15));

14. **December 7th** - Current Controversy in Political Science

Required Readings: Kristen Renwick Monroe (ed.), Perestroika!, The Raucous Rebellion in Political Science, Parts I, 2, and 3, pp. 1-290; Archie Brown, "Guest Letter: Comparative Politics: a View from Britain," APSA-CP Newsletter, Vol. 16, Issue 1, Winter 2005, pp. 1-5;

Recommended Readings: Part 4, "The Journals," Part 5 "Graduate Education, and Part 6, "Assessment," in Monroe (ed.), Perestroika!, pp. 291-353, 355-464, and 465-566; H. Brady and D. Collier (eds.), Rethinking Social Inquiry: Diverse Tools, Shared Standards, 2004; or 2005; Gerardo Munck and Richard Snyder, Passion, Craft, and Method in Comparative Politics, 2006 (hopefully, the library will acquire it at some point during the semester);

15. **December 14th** - seminar essays due (5:00 p.m.)