INSTRUCTIONS FOR THE DOCTORAL QUALIFYING PAPER

All students must submit one qualifying paper. Generally, these papers will be a minimum of 5000 words.

Submission Deadlines
The paper and its oral defense must be attempted by the end of the semester following the semester in which philosophy coursework is completed.

The paper cannot previously have been accepted for publication at the time it is submitted as the qualifying paper.

The paper must be submitted by October 15th in the Fall semester, or March 15th in the Spring semester. Students who complete philosophy coursework during the summer must submit a DQP by October 15th of that same year.

Assessment
The papers will be assessed by a committee of three faculty members. Each reader will grade the paper (submitted anonymously) and provide comments explaining the grade.

The paper review committee will be constituted by the DGS in consultation with the Department Chair. The DGS will approve a chair of the committee. The chair will collect the grade sheets and comments from each committee member, tally the overall grade, and communicate these results to the DGS. The student shall receive each evaluator’s comments.

Grading Rubric for Ph.D. Qualifying Paper
Each Faculty Member will Grade the Paper:
3: The paper is worthy of submission to a journal and so fulfills the requirements for the PhD program.
   Criteria:
The paper
   • makes a demonstrable contribution to existing literature, and
   • engages current literature in the field as appropriate and
   • is clearly written, well organized and reasonably argued.

2: The paper does not fulfill the requirement for the PhD.
   Criteria:
   First submission: The paper has promise, but fails to fulfill one or more of the above criteria.
   Second submission: The paper has promise, but fails to fulfill one or more of the above criteria, and/or (if the submission is a revision of the original paper) fails to respond to weaknesses as indicated by faculty comments on first submission.

1: The paper has serious deficiencies.
**Criteria:**

*The paper*  
- makes a weak or trivial contribution to existing literature, or  
- fails to engage relevant literature as appropriate, or  
- is superficial or confused in its presentation, or  
- has either a lack of argument or errors or gaps in the argument. Or,  
- if the submission is a revision of the original paper and the original grade was a 1, the paper fails to respond to weaknesses as indicated by faculty comments on first submission.

Members of the committee shall each return to the chair of the committee a grade of 3, 2, or 1, with explanatory comments suitable for transmission to the student (anonymously, PDF format). In cases where one member of the committee fails the paper, the committee shall meet to discuss the evaluations.

**Outcome of Grading:**

3 - Two or more faculty members gave the paper a grade of 3. Student may defend the paper to advance to candidacy.

2 - Two or more faculty members gave the paper a grade of 2 OR it received a grade of 1, 2, 3 (see appendix). The student may rework and resubmit the paper (if this was the first submission) or receive a terminal MA (if this was the first or second submission and the student has completed all other requirements to be advanced to candidacy) OR the student may enter either MA program and complete the additional program requirements for a terminal MA OR the student may leave the program.

1 - Two or more faculty members gave the paper a grade of 1. The paper does not fulfill the requirements for the PhD and is not well enough crafted to merit the award of a terminal MA. Student may enter either MA program and complete the additional program requirements for a terminal MA or leave the program.

If the paper receives a committee grade of 1 or 2, the student will be allowed to revise and resubmit the paper the following semester. If the paper requires resubmission, the same committee (if possible) will receive the resubmitted paper for review. The student may also choose to submit a new paper but this paper will be subject to the same deadline as a resubmission. In such a case a new committee may be constituted as appropriate. NOTE: If the student submits a new paper, the submission will still be considered a second submission (no further rewriting will be allowed).

**Oral Defense**

If the paper receives a committee grade of 3, then the student will publicly defend the paper orally no later than by the end of the week grades are due during the semester in which the DQP is submitted. The oral defense will be a Pass/Fail defense of the paper involving the three faculty members who graded the paper. The chair of the committee will schedule and oversee the defense. The defense shall be no more than 90 minutes.
There shall be one round of questions with the possibility of a second round. The discussion will then be opened to the floor. Two of the three members of the faculty board must award a Pass for the overall grade to be considered a Pass.

If students fail adequately to defend the paper they may be permitted one oral re-defense of the paper at a time designated by the DGS, no later than during the semester following the initial defense.

**Completion of Requirement**
Students will be considered to have passed the requirement for the PhD program after successful oral defense of the qualifying paper. Students who do not successfully defend their papers will not be allowed to continue in the PhD program. The student may receive a terminal MA (if the student has completed all other requirements to be advanced to candidacy) OR the student may enter either MA program and complete the additional program requirements for a terminal MA.

**Appeal Process**
DQP grade appeals will follow standard department and university grade appeal procedures.
Appendix

Possible Outcomes of Grading

*Three of same:*

- 333 -> grade=3
- 222 -> grade=2
- 111 -> grade=1

*Two of the same, one different:*

- 331 -> grade=3
- 332 -> grade=3
- 221 -> grade=2
- 223 -> grade=2
- 112 -> grade=1
- 113 -> grade=1

*All different*

- 123 -> grade=2

---

**Grade of 3:** 333, 331, 332
**Grade of 2:** 222, 221, 223, 123
**Grade of 1:** 111, 112, 113