

## Political Science 264: *Comparative Nationalism*

**Spring 2009, Thursday, 4:00-6:30**  
**Instructor: Prof. Lowell Barrington**  
**Phone: 288-5983**  
**Email: Lowell.Barrington@marquette.edu**

**Room: William Wehr 418**  
**Office: William Wehr 478**  
**Office Hours: MW 10:00-noon; Th 1:00-3:00**

“I have to admit that, as with many of my friends, being a Croat didn’t mean much to me ... I can only regret that awareness of my nationality came to me in such a painful way, through death, destruction, and the suffering of people, and through reduction, accusations, suspicions, and extreme homogenization. Being a Croat in this war makes me an orphan too, because it robbed me of the only possession I acquired in my life—my individuality. National consciousness, perhaps even nationalism, has been forced on people like an ill-fitting shirt. You may feel that the sleeves are too short and the collar too tight. You may not like the color and the cloth may itch. But you wear it because there is no other. In fact it would be an injustice to tear this shirt off, because of the people who are being slaughtered just because of their Croatian nationality. So no one is allowed not to be Croatian, and our attackers are to blame, for removing our freedoms to be firstly persons and citizens and then Croats.”

—Slavenka Drakulic, “Destined to be a Croat,” *Yugofax*, 6, October 31, 1991.

**Introduction:** In this course, we will examine one of the most important topics in the world today: nationalism. The course begins with an overview of nationalism, including topics such as definitions of nation and nationalism, different types of nationalism, and the reasons for nationalism’s development as a leading political principle. From there, we will spend several weeks examining the intersection between nationalism and other important topics in political science and the study of identity, including religion, multiculturalism, and institutional approaches to identity diversity. An important theme that we will revisit throughout the semester is American national identity: What makes us Americans?; is “multiculturalism” compatible with American national identity?; is American nationalism good or bad?; etc.

### **Readings:**

- (1) Anthony D. Smith, *The Nation in History: Historiographical Debates about Ethnicity and Nationalism* (Polity Press, 2000; 9781584650409).
- (2) Anthony D. Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History* (Polity Press, 2002; ISBN-13: 9780745626598).
- (3) Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008; ISBN-13: 9780801475009).
- (4) Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?: The Challenges to America’s National Identity* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2004; ISBN-13: 9780684870540).
- (5) Anatol Lieven, *America Right or Wrong: An Anatomy of American Nationalism* (Oxford University Press, 2005; ISBN-13: 9780195300055).
- (6) Anthony W. Marx, *Faith in Nation: Exclusionary Origins of Nationalism* (Oxford University Press, 2005; ISBN-13: 9780195182590).
- (7) Lowell W. Barrington, ed. *After Independence: Making and Protecting the Nation in Postcolonial & Postcommunist States* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2006; ISBN-13: 9780472068982).

You may also want to purchase the nationalism reader edited by John Hutchinson and Anthony Smith (*Nationalism*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994) to have on hand as a resource. There are also numerous other required readings on reserve (available electronically through the library’s electronic subscriptions to the journals and/or on the course D2L webpage).

The Gellner and Smith books are fairly short, but they capture well the major positions of these scholars. Smith and Gellner were two of the most influential scholars on the topic of nationalism in the second half of the twentieth century. More important for us, they represent fairly well the modernist and constructivist (Gellner) positions versus the perennialist and primordialist (Smith) positions.

**Requirements and grades:** You will be expected to attend each seminar and to have completed the week's readings prior to class. Two students will act as discussion facilitators each week (except Week 1). After my introduction on the week's topic, these individuals will make brief presentations on the readings. This will begin with an overview of the recommended reading(s) for that week, along with any questions the facilitators believe these readings raise worthy of discussion in class. The facilitators will then help organize subsequent discussion by focusing on things that they liked and disliked about the week's required readings, questions that the readings did not answer, etc. They will **not** be giving summaries of the required readings, and they will not be doing the majority of the talking during that particular session. The existence of the facilitator does not remove responsibility from the rest of the class for having read the required readings, and you are encouraged to have read the recommended readings as well.

Your major project will be a research paper on some aspect of nationalism. This paper will be 20-25 pages in length. The paper must focus on at least one specific country or nationalist movement and must add to our understanding of nationalism. If you cannot say in one sentence what your paper will add to the existing works on nationalism, pick another topic. You must show evidence of progress on your research project throughout the course, including a presentation on your research findings during last week of class. There is also a short assignment to be turned in at the beginning of the Week 3 session.

Your grade in this class will come from your short assignment (5%), your preliminary research topic presentation and written literature review (15%), the research paper itself (40%), your time as discussion facilitator (10%), and your overall participation (30%). Participation will also be used to determine final grades in cases where you end the semester in a "gray area" between two grades. In addition to participating in class discussions, I expect you to participate considerably in the post-class session D2L discussions. On the D2L website for this class, there will be a forum for discussion threads that will run from the end of each class session until the following class session. Part of your class participation grade will come from these D2L discussions. We will talk about the D2L requirement in more detail at the first class session.

## **SEMINAR AND READING SCHEDULE**

\* = Reading on reserve (or via library's electronic subscription to the journal)

\*\* = Reading available at the listed website

### **Part I: Definitions and Typologies**

**WEEK 1 (January 15): Introductory session.**

**WEEK 2 (January 22): Definition(s) of "Nation" and "Nationalism."**

#### ***Required Readings:***

Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, ch. 1 (pp. 1-7 only) and ch. 5 (pp. 53-62 only).

Anthony Smith, *The Nation in History*, Introduction (pp. 1-4).

Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 1.

Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?*, ch. 2 (pp. 21-33).

Lowell Barrington, "Introduction: Nationalism and Independence," in Lowell Barrington, ed., *After Independence* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2006), pp. 3-11 only.

#### ***Recommended Readings:***

\*Walker Connor, "A Nation is a Nation, is a State, is an Ethnic Group, is a ... ," *Nationalism*, pp. 36-43 only.

\*Ernest Renan, "Qu'est-ce qu'une nation? [What is a Nation?]," *Nationalism*, pp. 17-18.

\*Michael Ignatieff, "Nationalism and the Narcissism of Minor Differences," in Beiner, ed., *Theorizing Nationalism* (Albany, NY: State University Press of New York, 1999), pp. 91-102.

**WEEK 3 (January 29): Civic, Ethnic, and Other “‘Something’ Nationalisms.”**

**SHORT ASSIGNMENT DUE, January 29, in class. See description at end of syllabus.**

***Required Readings:***

Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, ch. 7.

Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 2.

Lowell Barrington, “Introduction: Nationalism and Independence,” in *After Independence*, pp. 14-22 only.

Anthony Marx, *Faith in Nation*, ch. 4.

\*Clifford Geertz, “The Integrative Revolution: Primordial Sentiments and Civil Politics in the New States,” in Clifford Geertz, ed., *Old Societies and New States: The Quest for Modernity in Asia and Africa*.

\*Bernard Yack, “The Myth of the Civic Nation,” in R. Beiner, ed., *Theorizing Nationalism*, pp. 103-118.

***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

\*Gerard Delanty and Patrick O’Mahony, *Nationalism and Social Theory: Modernity and the Recalcitrance of the Nation* (London: Sage, 2002), ch. 6 (“Towards a Typology of Forms of Nationalism”), pp. 120-141.

\*Taras Kuzio, “The Myth of the Civic State: A Critical Survey of Hans Kohn’s Framework for Understanding Nationalism,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 25, no. 1 (January 2002): 20-39.

**Part II: Theoretical Frameworks Explaining the Emergence of Nationalism**

**WEEK 4 (February 5): Explanations for When and How Nationalism Emerges, Part I: Perennialism and Primordialism.**

***Required Readings:***

\*Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 3 (pp. 43-45, 49-57 only), ch. 5 (pp. 87-107 only).

\*Pierre Van den Berghe, “A Socio-Biological Perspective,” *Nationalism*, pp. 97-103.

\*John Armstrong, *Nations Before Nationalism* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1982), ch. 1.

\*Walker Connor, “The Timelessness of Nations,” *Nations and Nationalism* 10, no. 1/2 (2004): 35-48.

***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

\*Connor, Walker. “Beyond Reason: The Nature of the Ethnonational Bond,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 16, no. 3 (July 1993): 373-389.

**WEEK 5 (February 12): Explanations for When and How Nationalism Emerges, Part II: Modernism and Constructivism.**

***Required Readings:***

\*Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 3 (pp. 45-49 only), ch. 4

\*Eric Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), ch. 2.

\*Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, chs. 1 and 3.

***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

\*Taylor, Charles. “Nationalism and Modernity” in Beiner, ed., *Theorizing Nationalism*, pp. 219-245.

**WEEK 6 (February 19): Explanations for When and How Nationalism Emerges, Part III: Smith versus Gellner.**

**Required Readings:**

Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, chs. 3-4, 6.

\*Ernest Gellner, "Nationalism and Modernization," *Nationalism*, pp. 55-63.

Anthony Smith, *The Nation in History*, ch. 1 (pp. 5-15 and 20-26 only), chs. 2-3.

Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 3 (pp. 57-61 only).

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:**

\*\*The Smith v. Gellner "Warwick Debate": <http://members.tripod.com/GellnerPage/Warwick.html>

**Part III: National Identity and ...**

**WEEK 7 (February 26): Institutional Responses to Ethnic and National Identity Diversity: Exclusion, Assimilation, Integration, Accommodation, and Ethnofederalism.**

**Required Readings:**

\*\*Dimostenis Yagcioglu, "Nation-States vis-a-vis Ethnocultural Minorities: Oppression and Assimilation versus Integration and Accommodation." Available at:  
<http://www.geocities.com/Athens/8945/minor.html>.

\*Brendan O'Leary, "What States Can Do with Nations: An Iron Law of Nationalism and Federation?," in T. V. Paul, G. John Ikenberry, and John A. Hall, eds., *The Nation-State in Question* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003), pp. 51-78.

\*Richard Simeon and Daniel-Patrick Conway, "Federalism and the Management of Conflict in Multinational Societies," in Alain-G. Gagnon and James Tully, eds., *Multinational Democracies* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 338-365.

\*Nicholas Sambanis, "Partition as a Solution to Ethnic War: An Empirical Critique of the Theoretical Literature," *World Politics*, July 2000: 437-483.

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Readings:**

\*Lowell Barrington, "Integration Policies in Estonia and Latvia: Can They Serve as Models for Other Multi-ethnic States?" paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association for the Study of Nationalities, New York, April 2003.

**WEEK 8 (March 5): Citizenship: Its Complex Relationship with National Identity.**

**Required Readings:**

Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?*, ch. 8 (pp. 178-220).

\*Lowell Barrington, "The Making of Citizenship Policy in the Baltic States," *Georgetown Immigration Law Journal* 13, no. 2 (Winter 1999): 159-199.

\*Lowell Barrington, "Russian-speakers in Ukraine and Kazakhstan: 'Nationality,' 'Population,' or Neither?," *Post-Soviet Affairs* 17 (April-June 2001): 129-158.

\*Nira Yuval-Davis, "Belongings: In between the Indigene and the Diasporic," in Umut Ozkirimli, ed., *Nationalism and Its Futures* (New York: Palgrave/Macmillan, 2003), pp. 127-144.

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Readings:**

\*Will Kymlicka, *Politics in the Vernacular: Nationalism, Multiculturalism, and Citizenship* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), ch. 17 ("Citizenship in an Era of Globalization: Commentary on Held"), pp. 317-326.

\*David Laitin, "Comment on Lowell Barrington," *Post-Soviet Affairs* 17 (April-June 2001): 159-163.

\*Lowell Barrington, "A Reply to David Laitin," *Post-Soviet Affairs* 17 (April-June 2001): 164-166.

**March 12: No Class, Spring Break.**

**Spring Break Assignment: Work on your papers.**

**WEEK 9 (March 19): Religion: Faith, National Identity, and Nationalism.**

**Required Readings:**

Anthony Marx, *Faith in Nation*, chs. 1, 3, 5, 6, and 7.

Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?*, chs. 4-5 (pp. 59-106), 12 (pp. 336-366).

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:**

\*Lisa Weeden, "Beyond the Crusades: Why Huntington, and Bin Laden, Are Wrong," *Middle East Policy*, vol. 10, no. 2 (2003): 54-61.

\*Dorothy Dohen, *Nationalism and American Catholicism* (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1967), ch. 8 ("The Fusion of Religion with Nationalism in the Pluralist Society"), pp. 175-192.

\*John Coakley, "Religion and Nationalism in the First World," in Daniele Conversi, ed., *Ethnonationalism in the Contemporary World: Walker Connor and the Study of Nationalism* (London: Routledge, 2004).

**Part III: National Identity and Nationalism in ...**

**WEEK 10 (March 26): The U.S.: American National Identity ... Right**

**Required Readings:**

Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?*, ch. 3 (pp. 37-58), ch. 6 (pp. 107-138), ch. 11 (pp. 295-335).

Roger Scruton, "The First Person Plural," in *Theorizing Nationalism*, pp. 279-294.

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Readings:**

\*De Tocqueville, Alexis. *Democracy in America* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 2000), pp. 201-286.

\*John H. McElroy, *American Beliefs: What Keeps a Big Country and a Diverse People United* (Chicago: Ivan R Dee, 1999), Appendix (pp. 227-228).

\*\*Ben Griffin, "Unhyphenated Canadians and Americans," *Interracial Voice*, available at: <http://interracialvoice.com/griffin2.html>.

**WEEK 11 (April 2): The U.S.: American National Identity ... Wrong**

**Required Readings:**

Anatol Lieven, *America Right or Wrong: An Anatomy of American Nationalism*, chs. 2-6.

**Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Readings:**

Robert B. Reich, "The Nationalism We Need," *The American Prospect*, November 30, 2002, [http://www.prospect.org/cs/articles?article=the\\_nationalism\\_we\\_need](http://www.prospect.org/cs/articles?article=the_nationalism_we_need)

Graham E. Fuller, "America's Uncomfortable Relationship With Nationalism," *The Stanley Foundation Policy Analysis Brief*, July 2006: 1-10, <http://www.stanleyfoundation.org/publications/pab/pab06nationalism.pdf>

**April 9: No Class, Easter Break. Literature review due next week!**

## **WEEK 12 (April 16): Postcolonial States.**

**RESEARCH PAPER LITERATURE REVIEW DUE, April 2, in class (see end of syllabus).**

### ***Required Readings:***

Joshua B. Forrest, "Nationalism in Post-Colonial States," in *After Independence*.

Diane K. Mauzy, "From Malay Nationalism to a Malaysian Nation?," in *After Independence*.

John F. Clark, "Rwanda: Tragic Land of Dual Nationalisms," in *After Independence*.

Peter J. Schraeder, "From Irredentism to Secession: The Death of Pan-Somali Nationalism," in *After Independence*.

### ***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

\*John Breuilly, *Nationalism and the State*, ch. 5 ("Approaches to Anti-colonial Nationalism") and ch. 10 ("Separatist Nationalism in the New States").

## **WEEK 13 (April 23): Postcommunist States.**

Ian Bremmer, "The Post-Soviet Nations after Independence," in *After Independence*.

Taras Kuzio, "Kravchuk to the Orange Revolution: The Victory of Civic Nationalism in Post-Soviet Ukraine," in *After Independence*.

Terry Clark, "Nationalism in Independent Lithuania: New Approaches for the Nation of 'Innocent Sufferers'," in *After Independence*.

Stephen Jones, "Georgia: Nationalism from under the Rubble," in *After Independence*.

### ***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

Razmik Panossian, "Post-Soviet Armenia: Nationalism & Its (Dis)contents," in *After Independence*.

## **Part IV: Conclusion**

## **WEEK 14: (April 30): Conclusion: What is To Be Done?**

### ***Required Readings:***

Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism*, chs. 8 and 10.

Anthony Smith, *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*, ch. 6.

Samuel Huntington, *Who Are We?: The Challenges to America's National Identity*, ch. 1.

Anatol Lieven, *America Right or Wrong: An Anatomy of American Nationalism*, ch. 1.

Lowell Barrington, "Introduction: Nationalism and Independence," in *After Independence*, pp. 22-30 only.

Ronald G. Suny, "Nationalism, National Making & the Postcolonial States of Asia, Africa, & Eurasia," in *After Independence*.

### ***Recommended and Discussion Facilitator Reading:***

\*Judith Lichtenberg, "How Liberal Can Nationalism Be?," in Beiner, ed., *Theorizing Nationalism*.

\*Jack Snyder, *From Voting to Violence* (New York: WW Norton, 2000) ch. 1 (pp. 25-43 only), ch. 2.

***Writing Assignments, POSC 264***

**SHORT ASSIGNMENT DUE, January 29, in class:** Find three additional examples of “something’ nationalisms” (beyond those mentioned in the readings for this week, including the recommended reading), the stranger the better. Give the citations where they can be found and, in three sentences for each one, explain what the person using the term meant by it.

**LITERATURE REVIEW (AT LEAST FOUR PAGES) DUE, April 16, in class.** This literature review should include the majority of the works you will be using for the literature review in the final version of the paper, and it should provide a clear discussion of the “gap” in the literature that your project is addressing.

**RESEARCH PAPER DUE, Thursday, May 7, 5:00 p.m. in my office (478 WWP) or my mailbox (4<sup>th</sup> floor, WWP).** The paper should be 20-25 pages, double-spaced, using 12 pt. Times New Roman font or some similar font, and 1 inch margins.